Defense Evaluation Rubric – for all Committee Members

To prepare for PhD Defense and Mentoring Meeting

The chair will collect completed rubrics from all committee members in order to submit combined feedback in the final Defense Qualtrics Rubric. The final Qualtrics Rubric will be filled out by the chair at the conclusion of the Defense.

Student Name: _____ Committee Member Name: _____

Is this the student's first or second attempt to take the defense?

○ *First Attempt;* ○ *Second Attempt;*

Initial Evaluation of Expectations based on written documents:

	Exceeds Expectations	Meets Expectations	Improvements Needed	Fails to Meet Minimal Expectations
DISSERTATION AND ORAL DEFENSE				
Possession of significant expertise in this research area	○	○	○	○
Intellectual ability to critically analyze and integrate knowledge from the literature to identify gaps in the research area	○	○	○	○
Appropriate experimental design to address their research question(s) in a rigorous and reproducible manner	○	○	○	○
Ability to develop and use technology to perform meaningful research	○	○	○	○
Critical analysis and interpretation of research results	○	○	○	○
Consideration of caveats and limitations of concluded research	○	○	○	○
Ability to make original contributions to the field and moved field forward in translational relevant ways	○	○	○	○
Technical merit of the work	○	○	○	○
Student's awareness of importance/broader impact of concluded research	○	○	○	○
Written Technical and Scientific Communication	○	○	○	○
Oral Technical and Scientific Communication (*complete at ORAL EXAM*)	○	○	○	○
DEFENSE PROFESSIONALISM				
CV	○	○	○	○
Publications from Research (Actual and Anticipated)	○	○	○	○
Presentations (Actual and Anticipated)	○	○	○	○

Feedback for Student's Future Research:

Anticipated or Future Career Plans:

Continued on next page

Do you have any concerns about plagiarism in the Written Research Proposal?
Please also reference the *Ithenticate* screening report sent to all committee members by the Chair:

Date of Screening: _____ *Similarity Index (in %):* _____

____ *No concerns;* ____ *Minor concerns (needs more guidance);* ____ *Multiple concerns (discussion needed)*

Defense Outcome Recommendation:

_____ Pass
_____ Fail (will repeat exam; must wait until at least the following session to repeat)
_____ Fail (2nd chance not offered or failed 2nd attempt)

Confidential Comments to the Chair regarding the Defense